

§ 28.86

4 CFR Ch. I (1-1-03 Edition)

BOARD DECISIONS, ATTORNEY'S FEES
AND JUDICIAL REVIEW

§ 28.86 Board procedures; recommended decisions.

(a) *Non-member recommended decisions.* Where an administrative judge who is not a Board member issues a decision, the administrative judge shall transmit to the parties and to the Board a recommended decision.

(b) Exceptions to the recommended decision shall be filed within 30 days from service of the decision. Exceptions may be filed by hand delivery or by mail. Please note that the address to be used differs for the two kinds of filing.

(1) *Filing by hand delivery:* Exceptions may be filed by hand delivery at the office of the Board, Suite 560, Union Center Plaza II, 820 First Street NE., Washington, DC.

(2) *Filing by mail:* Exceptions may be filed by mail addressed to the Personnel Appeals Board, Suite 560, Union Center Plaza II, 441 G Street, NW., Washington DC 20548. When filed by mail, the postmark shall be the exclusive date of filing.

The party filing the exceptions shall serve the Board with an original and 7 copies and shall serve one copy of the exceptions on each of the other parties. The exceptions shall include all supporting material and shall set forth objections to the recommended decision, with references to applicable laws or regulations, and with specific reference to the record. The responding party shall have 30 days from service of the exceptions to file any reply. Additional responsive pleadings may be filed only with the approval of the Board.

(c) Regardless of whether exceptions to a recommended decision are filed with the Board, the Board shall review the recommended decision. In reviewing the recommended decision, the Board shall review the record as though it were making the initial decision. The Board may adopt, reverse, remand, modify or vacate the recommended decision, in whole or in part. Where no party files exceptions to a recommended decision and the Board is considering any action other than adopting the recommended decision in whole as the final decision, the Board

shall provide the parties an opportunity to address the issues it is considering. Where appropriate, the Board shall issue a final decision and order a date for compliance. In reviewing any recommended decision, the Board may:

(1) Issue a single decision which decides the case;

(2) Hear oral arguments;

(3) Require the filing of briefs;

(4) Remand the proceedings to the administrative judge to take further testimony or evidence or make further findings or conclusions; or

(5) Take any other action necessary for final disposition of the case.

(d) The Board shall reject a recommended decision, in whole or in part, on the basis of its own motion or on the basis of exceptions filed by the parties, when the Board finds that:

(1) New and material evidence is available that, despite due diligence, was not available when the record was closed;

(2) The recommended decision is based on an erroneous interpretation of statute or regulation;

(3) The recommended decision is arbitrary, capricious or an abuse of discretion, or otherwise not consistent with law;

(4) The recommended decision is not made consistent with required procedures and results in harmful error; or

(5) The recommended decision is unsupported by evidence required by the requisite burden of proof as set forth at § 28.61.

(e) The decision of the Board shall be final and subject to judicial review pursuant to § 28.90.

[58 FR 61992, Nov. 23, 1993, as amended at 61 FR 36810, July 15, 1996]

§ 28.87 Board procedures; initial decisions.

(a) When a case is heard in the first instance by a single Board member, or a panel of members, an initial decision shall be issued by that member or panel and served upon the parties.

(b) An aggrieved party may seek review or reconsideration of the initial decision in the following manner:

(1) Within 15 days of the service of the initial decision, such a party may seek review by the full Board by filing

and serving a notice of appeal to the Board.

(2) Within 10 days of the service of the initial decision, such a party may file and serve a request for reconsideration with the administrative judge or panel rendering that decision. Filing of the request for reconsideration shall toll the commencement of the 15 day period for filing a notice of appeal with the full Board, pending disposition of the request for reconsideration by the administrative judge or panel. The administrative judge or panel shall determine if a response is required, and if so, will fix by order the time for the filing of the response. A motion for reconsideration will not be granted without providing an opportunity for response.

(c) Within 25 days following the filing of a notice of appeal to the full Board, the appellant shall file and serve a supporting brief. That brief shall identify with particularity those findings or conclusions in the initial decision that are challenged and shall refer specifically to the portions of the record and the provisions of statutes or regulations that assertedly support each assignment of error. Within 25 days following the service of the appellant's brief, the appellee may file and serve a responsive brief. Within 10 days following the service of the appellee's responsive brief, the appellant may file and serve a reply brief.

(d) In the absence of a timely appeal, the initial decision shall become the final decision of the Board 30 days following its issuance or the date of the administrative judge's or panel's disposition of a request for reconsideration (whichever comes later) unless, prior to the expiration of the 30 day period, the parties are notified in writing that the full Board intends to review the initial decision in whole or in part on its own motion. Such review sua sponte will normally be conducted only if a majority of the Board concludes that one or more issues of law addressed in the initial decision are of such importance as to warrant consideration by the full Board notwithstanding the absence of appeal. Issues so qualifying shall be identified in the Board's notice and the parties shall be provided an opportunity to brief them prior to the Board's decision.

(e) Oral argument on an appeal or in connection with a sua sponte review shall be held in the discretion of the Board. Any party may request that the Board exercise its discretion in that regard.

(f) Upon appeal or following its review sua sponte, the Board may affirm, reverse, modify or vacate the initial decision in whole or in part. If deemed warranted, the Board may remand the proceeding to the single member or panel for further action, including the reopening of the record for the taking of additional evidence. Unless the full Board expressly retains jurisdiction, the single member or panel shall render, on completion of the remand, a supplemental initial decision which shall be subject to appellate review in the same manner and to the same extent as provided for initial decisions in paragraphs (b), (d) and (g) of this section. If the Board does expressly retain jurisdiction at the time of remand, the single member or panel shall instead render a report to the Board on the remanded matters. Upon receipt of the report, the Board shall determine whether the views of the parties on the content of the report should be obtained in writing and, where necessary, shall fix by order the time for the submission of those views. A decision of the full Board disposing of the proceeding without a remand or, where the Board has expressly retained jurisdiction, following completion of the remand shall be the final decision of the Board and subject to judicial review.

(g) In conducting its examination of the initial decision, the Board may review the record as though it were making the initial decision itself. As a general matter, however, the Board will not overturn a finding of fact contained in the initial decision unless that finding is unsupported by substantial evidence in the record viewed as a whole. In determining whether some action other than affirmance of the initial decision is required, the Board will also consider whether:

(1) New and material evidence is available that, despite due diligence, was not available when the record was closed;

§ 28.88

(2) The initial decision is based on an erroneous interpretation of statute or regulation;

(3) The initial decision is arbitrary, capricious or an abuse of discretion, or otherwise not consistent with law;

(4) The initial decision is not made consistent with required procedures and results in harmful error.

(h) Initial decisions that become final without review by the full Board shall not be binding precedent in any other case.

§ 28.88 Board procedures; enforcement.

(a) A person required to take any action under the terms of a Board decision or order shall carry out its terms promptly, and shall, within 30 days after the decision or order becomes final, provide the Board and all parties to the proceeding with a compliance report specifying:

(1) The manner in which compliance with the provisions of the decision or order has been accomplished;

(2) The reasons why compliance with any provisions of the Board's order has not been fully accomplished; and

(3) The steps being taken to ensure full compliance.

(b) When the Board does not receive a notice of compliance in accordance with paragraph (a) of this section, the Solicitor shall make inquiries to determine the status of the compliance report. When the Solicitor establishes that a complete compliance report is not forthcoming, the Solicitor shall report the failure to file a complete compliance report to the Board.

(c) Any person and/or the General Counsel may petition the Board for enforcement of a final decision of the Board. The petition shall specifically set forth the reasons why the petitioner believes there is non-compliance.

(d) Upon receipt of a non-compliance report from its Solicitor or of a petition for enforcement of a final decision, the Board may issue a notice to any person to show cause why there was non-compliance. Following a show cause proceeding, the Board may seek judicial enforcement of its decision or order.

4 CFR Ch. I (1–1–03 Edition)

§ 28.89 Attorney's fees and costs.

Within 20 days after service of a final decision by the Board, or within 20 days after the date on which an initial decision becomes final pursuant to § 28.87(d), the petitioner, if he or she is the prevailing party, may submit to the administrative judge who heard the case initially a request for the award of reasonable attorney fees and costs. GAO may file a response within 20 days after service of the request. Motions for attorney fees shall be filed in accordance with § 28.21 of these regulations. Rulings on attorney's fees and costs shall be consistent with the standards set forth at 5 U.S.C. 7701(g). The decision of the administrative judge concerning attorney's fees and costs shall be subject to review and shall become final according to the provisions of §§ 28.86–28.87.

§ 28.90 Board procedures; judicial review.

(a) A final decision by the Board under 31 U.S.C. 753(a) (1), (2), (3), (6), (7) or (9) may be appealed to the United States Court of Appeals for the Federal Circuit within 30 days after the petitioner receives notice of the Board's decision.

(b) The Board may designate the Solicitor, the General Counsel or any other qualified individual to represent it in any judicial proceeding involving a Board decision or the interpretation of a Board rule or of the GAO Personnel Act.

[58 FR 61992, Nov. 23, 1993, as amended at 59 FR 59106, Nov. 16, 1994]

Subpart C—Oversight Procedures

§ 28.91 General.

Pursuant to section 732(f) of Title 31, U.S.C., the Board is authorized to conduct oversight of GAO employment regulations, procedures and practices as they relate to laws prohibiting discrimination in employment on the basis of race, color, religion, national origin, political affiliation, age, sex, marital status, or disability.