

findings and conclusions submitted by the parties as have not been made by the administrative law judge.

**§ 4.452-9 Appeal to Board.**

Any party, including the Government, adversely affected by the decision of the administrative law judge may appeal to the Board as provided in §4.410, and the general rules in Subpart B of this part. No further hearing will be allowed in connection with the appeal to the Board but the Board, after considering the evidence, may remand any case for further hearing if it considers such action necessary to develop the facts.

GRAZING PROCEDURES (INSIDE AND  
OUTSIDE GRAZING DISTRICTS)

SOURCE: 44 FR 41790, July 18, 1979, unless otherwise noted.

**§4.470 Appeal to administrative law judge; motion to dismiss.**

(a) Any applicant, permittee, lessee, or any other person whose interest is adversely affected by a final decision of the authorized officer may appeal to an administrative law judge by filing his appeal in the office of the authorized officer within 30 days after receipt of the decision. The appeal shall state the reasons, clearly and concisely, why the appellant thinks the final decision of the authorized officer is in error. All grounds of error not stated shall be considered as waived, and no such waived ground of error may be presented at the hearing unless ordered or permitted by the administrative law judge.

(b) Any applicant, permittee, lessee, or any other person who, after proper notification, fails to appeal a final decision of the authorized officer within the period prescribed in the decision, shall be barred thereafter from challenging the matters adjudicated in that final decision.

(c) When separate appeals are filed and the issue or issues involved are common to two or more appeals, they may be consolidated for purposes of hearing and decision.

(d) The authorized officer shall promptly forward the appeal to the State Director. Within 30 days after his

receipt of the appeal the State Director may file on behalf of the authorized officer a written motion, serving a copy thereof upon the appellant, requesting that the appeal be dismissed for the reason that it is frivolous, the appeal was filed late, the errors are not clearly and concisely stated, the issues are immaterial, the issue or issues were included in a prior final decision from which no timely appeal was made, or all issues involved therein have been previously adjudicated in an appeal involving the same preference, the same parties or their predecessors in interest. The appellant may file a written answer within 20 days after service of the motion upon him with the State Director. The appeal, motion, the proofs of service (see §4.401(c)), and the answers will be transmitted to the Hearings Division, Office of Hearings and Appeals, Salt Lake City, Utah. An administrative law judge, shall rule on the motion, and, if the motion is sustained, dismiss the appeal by written order.

**§4.471 Time and place of hearing; notice; intervenors.**

At least 30 days before the date set by the administrative law judge the authorized officer will notify the appellant of the time and place of the hearing within or near the district. Any other person who in the opinion of the authorized officer may be directly affected by the decision on appeal will also be notified of the hearing; such person may himself appear at the hearing, or by attorney, and upon a proper showing of interest, may be recognized by the administrative law judge as an intervenor in the appeal.

**§4.472 Authority of administrative law judge.**

(a) The administrative law judge is vested with the duty and general authority to conduct the hearing in an orderly, impartial, and judicial manner, including authority to subpoena witnesses, recognize intervenors, administer oaths and affirmations, call and question witnesses, regulate the course and order of the hearing, rule upon offers of proof and the relevancy of evidence, and to make findings of fact, conclusions of law, and a decision.

#### § 4.473

The administrative law judge shall have authority to take or to cause depositions to be taken. Subpoenas, depositions, the attendance of witnesses, and witness and deposition fees shall be governed by § 4.26 of the general rules in Subpart B of this part, to the extent such regulations are applicable.

(b) The administrative law judge also may grant or order continuances, and set the times and places of further hearings. Continuances shall be granted in accordance with § 4.452-3.

#### § 4.473 Service.

Service of notice or other documents required under this subpart shall be governed by §§ 4.413 and 4.422. Proof of such service shall be filed in the same office where the notice or document was filed within 15 days after such service, unless filed with the notice or document.

#### § 4.474 Conduct of hearing; reporter's fees; transcript.

(a) The appellant, the State Director or his representative, and recognized intervenors will stipulate so far as possible all material facts and the issue or issues involved. The administrative law judge will state any other issues on which he may wish to have evidence presented. Issues which appear to the administrative law judge to be unnecessary to a proper disposition of the case will be excluded; but the party asserting such issue may state briefly for the record the substance of the proof which otherwise would have been offered in support of the issue. Issues not covered by the appellant's specifications of error may not be admitted except with the consent of the State Director or his representative, unless the administrative law judge rules that such issue is essential to the controversy and should be admitted. The parties will then be given an opportunity to submit offers of settlement and proposals of adjustment for the consideration of the administrative law judge and of the other parties.

(b) Unless the administrative law judge orders otherwise, the State Director or his representative will then make the opening statement, setting forth the facts leading to the appeal.

#### 43 CFR Subtitle A (10-1-02 Edition)

Upon the conclusion of the opening statement, the appellant shall present his case, consistent with his specifications of error. (In the case of a show cause, the State Director shall set forth the facts leading to the issuance of the show cause notice and shall present his case following the opening statement.) Following the appellant's presentation, or upon his failure to make such presentation, the administrative law judge, upon his own motion or upon motion of any of the parties, may order summary dismissal of the appeal with prejudice because of the inadequacy or insufficiency of the appellant's case, to be followed by a written order setting forth the reasons for the dismissal and taking such other action under this subpart as may be proper and warranted. An appeal may be had from such order as well as from any other final determination made by the administrative law judge.

(c) In the absence or upon denial of such motion the State Director or his representative and recognized intervenors may present evidence if such a presentation appears to the administrative law judge to be necessary for a proper disposition of the matters in controversy, adhering as closely as possible to the issues raised by the appellant. All oral testimony shall be under oath or affirmation, and witnesses shall be subject to cross-examination by any party to the proceeding. The administrative law judge may question any witness whenever it appears necessary. Documentary evidence will be received by the administrative law judge and made a part of the record, if pertinent to any issue, or may be entered by stipulation. No exception need be stated or noted and every ruling of the administrative law judge will be subject to review on appeal. The party affected by an adverse ruling sustaining an objection to the admission of evidence, may insert in the record, as a tender of proof, a brief written statement of the substance of the excluded evidence; and the opposing party may then make an offer of proof in rebuttal. The administrative law judge shall summarily stop examination and exclude testimony on any